

**From:** Vincent Doyle [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Sunday, March 15, 2009 10:14 AM  
**To:** Rachelle Fisher  
**Cc:** Tommy Ancona; Tom Estes; Tim Estes; SFSPier33@aol.com; Randy Smith; Noyo Women for Fisheries; [REDACTED]; Mike Zamboni; 'Mike Cunningham'; Gerry Hemmingsen; [REDACTED]; Craig Goucher; Brett Fahning  
**Subject:** Crab Task force

**Attachments:** 0309COPC\_05%20Member%20reccomendations.pdf

Attached is OPC staff recommendations to the crab task force. We can live with most of the nominations, except the crab processing interest, these two processors buy from a very small portion of the fleet. In reading Paul Johnson's Bio. I see that he buys 50,000 pounds of crab a year, I would like to point out that the 5 year mean average in most ports for a "single" vessel in the crab fishery is around 50,000, in some ports more. What this means he comes to the table representing "ONE VESSEL".

I know that this is a grey area in the bill, but having served on the crab steering committee this was not the intent of the committee or the bill. The intent of the committee was to see that processors that buy from the largest portion of the fleet are represented. Maybe the processors should vote for their rep. like the fishermen did.

After a few phone calls and some internet work it looks like these two recommendations would better serve the Packard group than the processing sector.

In closing we feel that the needs of the industry would be better served by Joe Caito.

Thank You,  
Vincent Doyle  
Task Force Rep. Fort Bragg

**From:** Geoff Bettencourt [mailto:geoff@geoffbettencourt.com]  
**Sent:** Monday, March 16, 2009 10:08 AM  
**To:** Rachelle Fisher  
**Subject:** Re: Dungeness crab task force election results  
Hi Rachelle,

I wanted to send you a quick email to let you know that the Half Moon Bay fleet that is represented myself support the nominations and appointments as they stand. We feel as though the existing nominations follow the intent of the bill.

Thank you,

Geoff Bettencourt

From: [REDACTED]  
Sent: Monday, March 16, 2009 10:14 AM  
To: rfisher@scc.ca.gov  
Cc: [REDACTED]  
Subject: Re: Crab Task force

Rachelle,

After reviewing the selections for the Crab task force I am quite concerned with the processor representatives. It appears both representatives are representing the Packard foundation and the smallest of buyers. While I am a supporter of small buyers and most of my catch goes to small buyers, the larger processors must be represented on the committee since they are the only ones capable of processing all of Californias commercial crab catch.

Of equal concern is both Bill Carvalho's and Paul Johnson's ties to the Packard foundation. As I'm sure you're aware The Packard foundation is funding the MLPA process and has a vastly different view of commercial fisheries than the fishing community. After being briefed on Paul Johnsons biography I don't believe he can adequately represent the needs of the Dungeness crab fishery and that a representative from one of the larger processors such as Joe Caito or the Pacific group would better serve the Task Force.

Mike Zamboni  
Small boat representative  
Trinidad

**From:** Kirk Younker [REDACTED]

**Sent:** Monday, March 16, 2009 1:50 PM

**To:** rfisher@scc.ca.gov

**Cc:** Marija Vojkovich; Peter Kalvass

**Subject:** Processor nominations for Dungeness Crab Task Force

We ask that you replace Paul Johnson with Joe Caito on the processor seat for the task force. Joe Caito has many years of experience in the industry and will give a balanced view as to the real needs of a true dungeness crab processor from all ports in CA.

Kirk Younker  
Plant Manager  
Pacific Choice Seafood  
Eureka and Crescent City CA

**From:** Gerry H [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Monday, March 16, 2009 2:45 PM  
**To:** rfisher@scc.ca.gov; rfisher@coastalconservency.ca.gov  
**Subject:** Nominations

OPC  
C/O Rachelle Fisher

Re: Dungeness Crab Task Force Non Commercial Fishing Representatives

I have a concern with the OPC staff recommendation of Paul Johnson for the processor sector of the crab task force. While I don't personally know Paul Johnson I don't think he fits into the category of Crab processor. In his own Bio he states that he only processes 50,000 lbs of crab a year. I don't believe that would fairly represent processors. I believe Joe Caito would be much more representative of the processors doing business in the Dungeness crab industry in California

Thank You,  
Gerry Hemmingsen  
Representative Crescent City

**From:** Caito Fisheries, Inc. [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Monday, March 16, 2009 2:48 PM  
**To:** rfisher@scc.ca.gov  
**Subject:** Recent Nominations  
TO: Ocean Protection Council

Regarding your two recent nominations for the Ocean Protection Council positions, neither one is a crab processor in California. A crab processor is someone that has a processing plant that is able to whole cook crabs for fresh markets, freeze sections and whole cooked crabs, as well as, pick crabmeat. I would hope that someone would be nominated that is an actual crab processor and that has a vested interest in the crab fisheries.

Sincerely,

Joseph A. Caito  
President  
Caito Fisheries, Inc.

**From:** Brett Fahning [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Monday, March 16, 2009 2:57 PM  
**To:** Rachelle Fisher  
**Subject:** task force

Rachelle,

I am writing to express my concerns with the selection of Paul Johnson for one of the processor seats on the Dungeness Crab Task Force. Although I do not know Mr. Johnson personally, and do not doubt his vested interest and knowledge of the crab industry, and do not believe him to be a viable candidate to represent processing and brokering interests for the California dungeness crab industry. It is stated in Mr. Johnson's bio that he buys about 50,000 lbs of crab per year. This is an extremely small amount relative to the estimated 8 million pounds annually caught on average in the state of California. Mr. Johnson deals almost entirely with live crab. I believe that with the selection of Bill Carvalho, this segment of the crab market will be well represented. In fact, I believe Mr. Carvalho had no crabs cooked in the 2008/2009 season meaning 100% of the crab Mr. Carvalho bought this year went to the live market.

An extremely large portion (I'm sure the majority) of crab caught in the state of California goes to the whole cooked and section markets. The selection of these 2 processors leaves and huge void on the task force. We simply need the input and view points of a processor that deals more exclusively with the whole cooked and section market. I believe that Joe Caito would be a much more qualified candidate to fill this seat on the Task Force.

Thank you,

Brett Fahning  
F/V Rogue

# *Coastal Fishboat Owners Alliance*

*“Viable Fisheries for the Future”*

P.O. Box 1645 Fort Bragg, CA. 95437      Ph./ Fax: 707-964-8058

March 16,2009

California Ocean Protection Council

Rachelle Fisher

The Coastal Fishboat Owners Alliance have concerns with the level of participation by participants with ties to the Packard Foundation and other environmental groups.

At every level of fisheries management NGO's have become embedded in the process and with the unlimited resources they have, in some venues ( MLPA'S) are the primary source of funding. This tends to direct the out comes in favor of their agenda rather than the public or fishing communities interest.

At the federal level the Pacific Fishery Management Council is at times stifled in what is best for the industry because of frivolous lawsuits threatened or real by these groups.

And now, the DCTF has a processor whose company is heavily financed by Packard and another who actually buys very little product and if my information is correct does very little or no processing of crab. It would seem prudent to have one of the major processors involved.

Lets get a breath of fresh air and find a facilitator whose achievements has less to do with the environmental community and more with the interest of the user groups being affected by the outcomes of this committee.

Respectfully,

Jim Ponts

President CFOA



**From:** [REDACTED]

**Sent:** Monday, March 16, 2009 3:20 PM

**To:** rfisher@scc.ca.gov

**Subject:** crab task force

I am writing to address the selection of the processor representation for the California dungeness task force. My understanding is that the processors to be selected are Paul Johnson and Bill Carvallo. The concern I have along with several fishermen in my Assoc. is that Paul Johnson is a poor representative of the processing and marketing of dungeness in California. A large and important part of marketing crab, is in the form of sections and whole cooks and we feel Paul Johnson has a limited if any experience in these markets. We are also concerned that a person who buys 50,000 lbs of crab per year should be considered a processor, not to say he should not be represented in this task force, but to give him the voting power of a processor is wrong.

**From:** MIKE CUNNINGHAM [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Monday, March 16, 2009 3:47 PM  
**To:** rfisher@scc.ca.gov  
**Subject:** Processor seat on crab taskforce  
To: California Ocean Protection Council  
1330 Broadway, 13th Floor  
Oakland, CA 94612

Dear Council Members,

This letter is written in regard to the appointment of a seafood processor to the Dungeness crab taskforce. As one of the elected commercial fisherman representatives from Eureka and on behalf of those fishermen in my production tier, I encourage you to select Mr. Bill Carvahlo and Mr. Joe Caito to fill the two processor seats on the taskforce. While this recommendation is not in concert with the Ocean Protection Council (OPC) staff suggestion of Mr. Carvahlo and Mr. Paul Johnson, we believe that the inclusion of Mr. Caito will provide a much better balanced and broader experience to the taskforce. Given the fact that the vast majority of commercially harvested crab in California is marketed as processed product, i.e., as shell crab, sectioned crab or as crab meat, Mr. Caito's lifetime of experience in the processing industry will prove invaluable to the taskforce. To not include Mr. Caito will in fact leave a void in the taskforce membership too important to ignore. While Mr. Carvahlo will be able to address live market issues, Mr. Caito will lend his vast expertise and broad knowledge of the processing sector to our discussions and deliberations. We therefore strongly encourage you to appoinment Mr. Caito and Mr. Carvahlo to the California Dungeness crab taskforce.

On behalf of Eureka Crab fishermen,

Michael cunningham

**From:** [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Monday, March 16, 2009 4:12 PM  
**To:** rfisher@scc.ca.gov  
**Subject:** Crab Task Force  
Good Afternoon,

I would like to strongly recommend that Joe Caito be selected for the Crab Task Force. If you would like any more background or information, please feel free to email me or call me at 415-640-6175.

Thank You

Wm. T Dawson (Bill)  
President  
Seafood Suppliers Inc.

Jim Anderson

Phone

---

Monday, March 16, 2009

**Rachelle Fisher**

OPC  
1330 Broadway, Suite 1300  
Oakland, CA 94612

**Fax; 510-286-0470**

Jim Anderson

---

**Monday, March 16, 2009**

**Rachelle Fisher  
California Ocean Protection Council  
1330 Broadway, Suite 1300  
Oakland, CA 94612**

**Dear Rachelle,**

**The recommendations for the seats other than fishermen seem to be a fair cross section of the fisheries. I believe that the proposed and elected members of this task force will be able to have healthy discussions, on how to improve this Dungeness Crab Fisheries. It has been brought to my attention that after a fair and legal election, with most of last year spent setting the criteria for voting, a group of fishermen wants to change the people that are on the task force. I hope this is not the way, this task force, is going from the start.**

**I feel we can work with the task force that has been posted for both fishermen and non-fishermen representatives.**

**Sincerely,**



**Jim Anderson**

John J. Atkinson



March 16, 2009

To Whom it May Concern:

My name is John Atkinson and I am the Vice President of the San Francisco Crab Boat Owners Association and I also represent the high tier production level for San Francisco.

I just wanted to thank you for the excellent job you did in selecting the voting and non-voting members of the Crab Committee. Everyone in the steering committee wanted a fair process and I feel that is exactly what has been accomplished.

Thank you  
John J. Atkinson



**CRAB BOAT OWNERS ASSOCIATION, Inc.**

2907 Jones Street  
San Francisco, California 94133-1115  
415-885-1180

---

March 16, 2009  
Christine Blackburn  
California Ocean Protection Council  
1330 Broadway, 13<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Oakland, CA 94612

Re: Dungeness Crab Task Force

Dear Ms. Blackburn,

It has come to our attention that there have been complaints about the proposed slate of members for the Dungeness Crab Task Force.

Crab Boat Owners Association has some issues of its own with some of the appointees as well, but we figured that when everyone is complaining, it means that the OPC did a balanced job of selecting.

We hear that the potential appointee at issue is Paul Johnson of the Monterey Fish Company. It is our belief that Mr. Johnson has a very good grasp of the marketing issues facing the San Francisco Bay Area, host to the largest numbers of Dungeness Crab eaters in the State of California.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Larry Collins". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Larry Collins, President

